

Divisions affected: University Parks, *Jericho and Osney*

**CABINET MEMBER FOR TRANSPORT MANAGEMENT
14 DECEMBER 2023**

**OXFORD: BROAD STREET - TEMPORARY PUBLIC REALM
SCHEME**

Report by Corporate Director, Environment and Place

RECOMMENDATION

1. **The Cabinet Member for Transport Management is RECOMMENDED to approve the following:**
 - Make the current Experimental Traffic Regulation Order (ETRO) on Broad Street permanent to a Traffic Regulation Order, retaining the current street furniture until a more permanent scheme is developed and further funding is secured.
 - Subject to remaining budget for the temporary scheme, implement the recommended interventions set out in paragraph 70.
 - To seek funding to investigate medium- and longer-term measures as part of a newly funded project that will further enhance Broad Street and surrounding streets, taking into consideration any additional interventions noted within this report.

Executive Summary

About the Scheme

2. On [21 July 2022](#) the Cabinet Member for Transport Management (previously known as Highways Management) approved the making of the proposed ETRO on Broad Street. Subsequently, a decision on changes to parking arrangements on St Giles' and Parks Road was made at the meeting on [13 October 2022](#). These proposals were made in line with the [Central Oxfordshire Travel Plan](#), which included:
 - a) Temporary suspension of the pay and display parking on Broad Street;
 - b) The relocation (and slight reduction) of existing motorcycle parking from Broad Street to St Giles';
 - c) The relocation of existing loading/goods vehicle only bays within Broad Street;
 - d) A 24/7 loading ban in some areas of Broad Street; and
 - e) The relocation (of 4) and addition of (+1) disabled parking bays from Broad Street to Parks Road, as well as relocating four existing bays within Broad Street;
 - f) Introduction of a new 'drop off only' bus stop on Parks Road.

Engagement and Consultation

3. This report represents the outcome of the ETRO, which includes responses received during the [statutory consultation period](#) (25 October 2022 to 31 July 2023, extended beyond the initial 6-month period to gather comments from all seasons of the year), and extensive monitoring carried out before and during the experimental period, of which informed the recommendations set out in this report.
4. Officers engaged with key stakeholders including local businesses who trade on or near Broad Street, bus operators, the emergency services, University of Oxford Colleges, Oxford City Council and various other stakeholders. Over 150 stakeholders (internal and external) helped shape the design of the current scheme and many have continued to provide valuable feedback throughout the duration of the experiment.

Summary of Feedback

5. Over 700 responses were received during the statutory consultation period. Most responses to the online survey are in support of the current experimental scheme with 60% who either 'really liked' or 'generally liked' the scheme.

6. Several responses focused on the need to provide a more permanent scheme which would be better suited to the street in terms of aesthetics but also provide a greater sense of pedestrianisation. Suggestions included planting trees and plants in the ground instead of using wooden planters and higher quality furniture that complements the surrounding buildings.
7. Responses indicated that some road users and stakeholders had concerns relating to road safety, in part due to the layout of the scheme; design of the scheme with minimal highway lines and signs; and number of movements made by vehicles - particularly larger vehicles such as buses and delivery vehicles.
8. A detailed analysis of feedback is set out from paragraph 34.

Background

9. Following the success of Oxford City Council's [Broad Meadow scheme](#) in 2021, Oxfordshire County Council's Cabinet allocated funds to deliver a larger in size and longer in duration temporary public realm scheme to further benefit those working in, visiting or passing through Broad Street.
10. A key part of the Council's [Local Transport and Connectivity Plan](#) (LTCP), adopted in July 2022, is to prioritise people over motor vehicles. Broad Street has, in recent history, been dominated by cars which takes away the sense of place and has not been seen as pedestrian friendly. In line with the targets set out in the LTCP, as well as other key policies introduced and implemented by the County Council, the Broad Street scheme aims to reduce motor vehicle volumes and encourage more walking, wheeling, and cycling, facilitated by the introduction of a placemaking scheme to meet, sit, and enjoy the historic street.
11. Broad Street is a key east/west cycle route in the city and forms part of the National Cycle Network route 51. In line with the County Council's strategic approach to transport and the adopted Oxford Local Cycling and Walking Infrastructure Plan, it is essential that the street maintains access for people cycling, particularly following the permanent closure of St Michaels Street which was previously an alternative east/west cycle route in the city. In agreement with Oxford City Council, Oxfordshire County Council has committed to keeping the cycle lane open on Broad Street all year round. The exception to this is when certain large-scale events take place (such as the Oxford Half Marathon), and when emergency works require a road closure.
12. There are limited public spaces that offer people a place to sit, dwell and relax in the city, the Broad Street scheme has clearly shown the important role that these spaces play and what they offer to the people working, visiting, or living in the city. This is evidenced by the number of people using the space and the variety of activities that have taken place on the street since the scheme opened. There is also a need to provide more green space and economic benefits to the businesses on Broad Street, which this scheme has aimed to achieve to an extent with the introduction of trees and seasonal planting and increase in opportunities for activities and events that may increase footfall levels.
13. With the end of the ETRO period approaching (22nd February 2024), there is a need to seek a decision on the future of this experimental scheme.

Financial Implications

14. The approved funding associated with this temporary scheme is set out below:

Funding	Amount	Approval Status
Capital Programme	£500,000	8 February '22, Council
S106	£85,000	25 January '23, Major Infrastructure Board

Table 1 – Approved funding for the Broad Street scheme.

15. If the current temporary scheme is removed, the cost is estimated at £20,000 and would be funded by the current scheme.

16. If the scheme were to be made permanent the following ongoing costs are shown below:

Funding	Item/Activity	FY 23/24	FY 24/25¹	Sign off
Capital – covered under remaining budget	Introduction of permanent tactile paving and dropped kerbs in the areas where there is currently temporary tactile paving and temporary kerb ramps.	£25,000	N/A	N/A
Revenue – ongoing costs	Maintenance (highway inspector checks, watering, vegetation management, and repairs to street furniture and the highway)	£10,000	£10,000	Head of service, Highway Maintenance – 01/12/2023
	Loss of parking revenue	£340,000	£354,000	Head of service, Network Management – 30/11/2023

Table 2 – Ongoing costs if the scheme is made permanent.

17. Currently there is no allowance for making any other features permanent (such as permanently fixed planters, trees, or seats) or ongoing monitoring (including officer time), therefore additional funding would need to be sought.

18. It is anticipated any future maintenance within the County Council’s statutory duties will be included within the council’s maintenance budget. It will therefore be an ongoing maintenance liability of approximately £10,000 per year. An agreement is required between both the County Council and Oxford City Council to confirm maintenance and stewardship responsibilities for specific elements of the street going forward i.e. maintaining the planters and moving of furniture for events. There are also opportunities to consider businesses, colleges or local community groups to take on a stewardship role, such as maintaining planting or opportunities to provide a form of social and therapeutic horticulture.

19. The temporary proposal included the removal of existing pay and display parking spaces on Broad Street which resulted in a loss of revenue for the County Council. Therefore, if the scheme were to be made permanent, the Council will continue to

¹ It should be considered that figures in financial year 2024/25 will be the similar for future years.

lose this annual revenue, on a permanent basis. *Table 3* below displays the revenue received from parking on Broad Street between 2018 and 2022. In light of the impact the Covid-19 pandemic had on revenue in 2020/21, the average revenue generated per year is approximately £340,000 based on the most recent financial year's data, however in line with planned increases to pay and display parking, the revenue lost will increase to £354,000 from 2024/25.

Financial Year	Revenue
2018/19	£192,927.70
2019/20	£283,659.30
2020/21	£155,288.40
2021/22	£306,392.30
2022/23 (From Apr to Sept 2022 only)	£168,963.20

Table 3 – Revenue generated from pay and display parking on Broad Street

20. Although parking revenue is removed, other revenue can be raised through events. Since opening in October 2022, the total revenue received² from events on Broad Street or using Broad Street equates to £50,550.50 between both council's. It is possible that this revenue could increase if more events took place in Broad Street.

Equality and Inclusion Implications

21. No negative implications in respect of equalities or inclusion have been identified in the recommendations set out in this report. The recommendation set out in paragraph 70 would provide a positive impact as accessibility within the street will be improved.
22. An Equalities Impact Assessment was carried out prior to the implementation of the temporary scheme. The assessment identified either a 'positive impact' or 'no impact' against the criteria. The Equalities Impact Assessment is provided in Annex 1 and has been reviewed throughout the duration of the scheme to ensure it is up to date.
23. During the experimental period, engagement with key stakeholders representing groups with different needs continued. For example, walkabout sessions were held with Oxford City Council's Inclusive Transport and Movement Focus Group (a group of people representing multiple transport and disability related groups) and separately with MyVision Oxfordshire (representing people with varied visual impairments). The aim of these sessions was to identify any issues following implementation of the scheme, and to assess whether any further improvements could have been made to the scheme under the ETRO, if appropriate. Improvements involved rearranging street furniture to improve the ease of navigating through the spaces and making use of a patterned surface to help guide people with visual impairments through the space.

² This is the total revenue figure for events held from October 2022 to December 2023, which is shared between Oxford City Council and Oxfordshire County Council at a 80/20 split (city/county).

Sustainability Implications

24. The proposals support the County Councils' vision to deliver a zero-carbon Oxfordshire transport system that enables the county to thrive whilst protecting the environment and making Oxfordshire a better place to live for all residents.
25. As part of the County Council's commitment to ensure that the climate and the natural environment are at the heart of all our decision making, officers undertook a Climate Impact Assessment (CIA) in May 2022. This looked at aspects of the scheme and the implications of proposed actions for people and their environment, while looking at ways to improve them. This can be found in Annex 2.
26. As detailed in paragraphs 78-80 due to limited air quality data available it is not possible to comment on the impact the scheme has made to air quality levels on Broad Street. However, existing levels are below the national legal limit for NO₂ and the local annual mean target. It is expected that levels will remain under these limits with the potential for further improvement to air quality levels.

Staff Implications

27. Ongoing staffing resource is anticipated should the scheme be made permanent, approximately 1-2 days a month. This includes officer time spent responding to event consultations, attending business trader association meetings, monitoring on-going data collection and time spent undertaking maintenance duties.

Legal Implications

28. The ETRO was promoted and is recommended to be made permanent applying the powers and duties set out in the Road Traffic Regulation Act 1984 and related regulations. The appropriate statutory consultation has taken place and consultation requirements relating to the ETRO will continue to be complied with, as will any other relevant statutory duty applicable, should the ETRO be made permanent.

Statutory Consultation

About the Consultation

29. The formal consultation on the ETRO ran from 25 October 2022 – 31 July 2023. Initially, the consultation was scheduled to end on 24 April 2023, however, officers decided to extend the period to get responses that reflect the scheme all year round, including the summer months when footfall is typically higher in the city.

How the Council Consulted

30. A notice was published in the Oxford Times newspaper and an email sent to statutory consultees, including emergency services, bus operators, Oxford City Council, local City ward councillors, the relevant Division County Councillors and pedestrian and cycle groups. Additionally, street notices were placed on site in the immediate vicinity.

31. A dedicated [Broad Street webpage](#) was developed to provide information about the scheme and links to the statutory consultation.

32. An online survey was prepared via Let's Talk Oxfordshire whereby people could respond to the statutory consultation by answering a set of questions or provide feedback via a guestbook feature. QR codes were placed around the scheme to raise awareness of the consultation.

33. Over 700 responses were received during the statutory consultation period, of which 643 were survey responses³ (hosted on Let's Talk Oxfordshire), of which a summary can be found in Annex 3, alongside 30 further comments submitted on the Let's Talk Oxfordshire public guestbook (see paragraph 39 for more detail). Additionally, 43 email responses were received, including responses from organisations and general comments from the public.

Overview of Responses

34. The outcomes to the headline questions received from the survey on Let's Talk Oxfordshire are shown in *Table 4* below.

Response	Number	Percentage
Really liked or generally liked	386	60%
Did not like or had parts that did not work for them	226	35.1%
Undecided/neutral	31	4.9%
TOTALS	643	100%

Table 4 – Summary of headline questions

³ Throughout the Let's Talk Oxfordshire survey, questions were not compulsory and therefore some were skipped by respondents. This means that the base sizes do not equal the entire sample size.

35. The responses to a question regarding specific features of the scheme are detailed in *Table 5* below.

Subject	Response	Number	Percentage
Including tree and flowers in planters around the street	Really or mostly liked	456	71.9%
	Really or mostly disliked	133	21%
	Undecided/neutral	45	7.1%
	TOTALS	634 (9 skipped)	100%
Having seating where you can rest and socialise	Really or mostly liked	475	74.8%
	Really or mostly disliked	113	17.8%
	Undecided/neutral	47	7.4%
	TOTALS	635 (8 skipped)	100%
Removing existing pay and display parking	Really or mostly liked	432	68.2%
	Really or mostly disliked	144	22.7%
	Undecided/neutral	57	9%
	TOTALS	633 (10 skipped)	100%
Allowing cycling through Broad Street at all times	Really or mostly liked	452	70.8%
	Really or mostly disliked	122	19.1%
	Undecided/neutral	64	10%
	TOTALS	638	100%

Table 5 – Summary of responses about specific elements of the scheme.

36. Key themes identified from the consultation are summarised below.

37. Those supporting the scheme identified many benefits including:

- The removal of parking and the subsequent reduction in traffic has made the whole street feel safer to use;
- Increased cycle parking in the city centre and the subsequent encouragement to cycle in to the city;
- The provision of a place available for community gathering and walking tours;
- Dedication of space for pedestrians;
- The addition of green space in the city centre; and
- The potential for events all year round.

38. Those with concerns about the scheme identified the following:

- The construction site at the western end and its interference with access to Broad Street;

- The behaviour of some of the people cycling;
- The lack of signage on and near the street, leading to confused behaviour from motorists trying to access the street;
- Uncertainty of where to cross and who has priority; and
- The removal of parking and the subsequent accessibility impacts.

Guestbook Responses

39. The Let's Talk Oxfordshire survey had a guestbook feature that encouraged those visiting the website to leave comments or feedback regarding the scheme. This received a total of 30 responses. Generally, these were all in favour of the scheme but with suggested changes and improvements. The most common themes were:

- Road safety concerns in relation to the junction at Turl Street as well as the cycle/emergency lane in the west;
- Quality of the furniture and potential improvements to be made to enhance what is already there, e.g., shade and shelter;
- Future to facilitate the needs of wheelchair users, e.g. tables; and
- Permanent planting.

Email Responses

40. Throughout the consultation period, an additional 44 responses were sent via email. They mainly highlighted the following themes:

- Safety concerns, especially those regarding the usage of the space by motorised vehicles and cyclists;
- The continued presence of cars on the street;
- The quality of the furniture and the overall design of the scheme;
- General accessibility issues; and
- Feedback from event organisers and users of the space.

Organisational Responses

41. Organisations either directly related to or with a vested interest in Broad Street submitted responses during the consultation period.

42. The University of Oxford Colleges and associated organisations on or close to Broad Street submitted a consolidated letter with each of their comments highlighted. Each organisation shared road safety concerns, a desire for better signage at the entry points and on Broad Street itself, and a traffic management plan to reduce the volumes of vehicular traffic. The History of Science Museum welcomed the scheme as a complementary measure to the museum, especially during a planned upcoming closure. Loading and delivery issues were also highlighted. Historic England and the Oxford Preservation Trust also submitted responses both welcoming the scheme while emphasising the importance of a historical assessment to understand and complement the significance of Broad Street within Oxford.

43. Cyclox submitted a response that assessed individual aspects to the schemes in relation to cycling. Positives highlighted included the increase in accessibility for cycling and walking and the importance of a public realm space for pedestrians. They also noted potential improvements going forward that could be considered if the scheme is made permanent.
44. Oxford City Council welcomed the scheme and considered it a success in terms of creating a larger, well-used space for people to sit and enjoy the beautiful setting of Broad Street. The City Council highlight the positive outcomes of working in partnership with one another, however, raise some concerns regarding the stewardship of space, public events, the lifespan of current infrastructure and Local Planning Authority considerations, all of which are addressed in paragraphs 47-52. The City Council suggest improvements to the usability of space in the short and long term, such as increasing shade and shelter and amending the layout to extend into the frontage of The Store hotel, once open. Longer-term suggestions were related to the importance of this scheme in its wider context and the need for significant additional funding and resource.
45. Oxford Bus Company generally supported the objectives of the scheme, considering it as a “stepping stone” to facilitate future developments on Broad Street. They provided an in-depth analysis of how well the objectives were achieved, raising concerns that the objectives are not representative of the role and function of Broad Street as a transport corridor. They recognised that whilst many of the scheme objectives were met, there are tensions in the operations of the street. The Oxford Bus Company are in favour of a permanent scheme given that their raised concerns and issues are noted and resolved in order for it to be operationally sound.
46. Unlimited Oxfordshire generally welcomed the scheme but expressed concerns that disabled people had not been well considered throughout, in particular regarding the moving of four of the disabled bays onto Parks Road, which they believe has not got the right camber to accommodate disembarking a vehicle on a wheelchair as it is too steep. Furthermore, they make mention of road safety concerns when navigating the shared pedestrian and cycle space outside Balliol College as those who struggle to walk face difficulties using the crossings. They highlighted the potential for more leisure, dining and entertainment.

Officer Response to Objections/Concerns and additional interventions.

47. Most of those objecting to the scheme cited the desire to park close to the city centre or did not support the removal of parking in general. Oxford has five park-and-ride services that frequently serve the city; extensive parking in the Westgate Shopping Centre, Gloucester Green, Oxpens and Worcester Street; and pay and display parking on St. Giles, Parks Road and Mansfield Road.
48. Those concerns relating to the presence of the cycle lane along the western end have been noted by the council. However, the County Council has committed to keeping the cycle lane open on Broad Street all year round as it is essential to ensure the city has a continuous east-west cycle route; something that was reflected in the consultation response that saw 62.5% of respondents express the importance of cycling through here. The exception to this is when certain large-scale events take place (such as the Oxford Half Marathon), and when emergency works require a road closure. Road safety data suggests that cyclists and pedestrians can and do share spaces without incident, with 14 recorded incidents on Broad Street since 2017 and only one of these being between a cyclist and a pedestrian.
49. Despite the removal of pay and display parking on Broad Street, some concerns were raised about the general safety of the street and those who use it, broadly from a pedestrian perspective and how cyclists, private car users, buses and HGV drivers interact with it. Since the County Council was granted powers to enforce traffic restrictions with automatic number plate recognition (ANPR) cameras, the rising bollard site on Broad Street has been identified as a future site for enforcement cameras to prevent the movement of vehicles into the [western end](#). Furthermore, as part of a wider Vision Zero strategy being developed by the County Council, “near-miss” technology is being implemented on the junction with Turl Street to allow officers to closely monitor any near-miss conflicts between pedestrians, cyclists and motorised vehicles. This will allow for any necessary action to take place with evidence to support it.
50. Concerns relating to the accessibility and location of disabled bays on Parks Road and Broad Street have been noted by the County Council. Officers have observed both locations are well used by blue badge holders. Furthermore, the reallocation of the disabled bays across Broad Street and Parks Road has resulted in a net gain of one bay in the local area. As identified by key stakeholders representing inclusive transport members and recommendations raised within the Road Safety Audit, there is a need for permanent dropped kerbs to enable all users to safely navigate the street. This item is addressed within the recommendations of this report (paragraph 70).
51. Concerns raised regarding the stewardship of the space highlights that there is a need to address the ongoing and future management and maintenance of the street. The County Council will work with the City Council to agree on shared responsibilities and budget requirements of the remaining ETRO period as well as on an on-going basis should the scheme be made permanent. The Central

Oxfordshire Movement and Place Framework, which is being jointly delivered by both council's, will assist in addressing stewardship challenges currently experienced across the city.

52. Since the scheme began in October 2022, there have been the same number of deployed civil enforcement officers around the city, with the average number of parking tickets issues on Broad Street dropping in line with the removal of pay and display parking. Despite this, there have still been 206 legitimate tickets issued⁴ between October 2022 and October 2023. This demonstrates that the space is clearly still being used by some private vehicles, despite the removal of pay and display parking and the reorganisation of the space. Following the decision of this recommendation, civil enforcement officers should continue to closely monitor the site and further investigations into additional interventions may address any ongoing concerns.

⁴ Those tickets that have been issued without officer error and/or vehicle driving away before ticket could be placed on vehicle.

Monitoring and Evaluation

53. Extensive monitoring was undertaken pre-scheme and post-scheme implementation. A high-level analysis is provided below.

54. Forms of monitoring included traffic surveys, air quality measurements, and officer monitoring through site visits and observations.

Traffic Surveys

55. The County Council commissioned a series of traffic surveys to take place on and around Broad Street to assess the impact the scheme. The surveys included Pedestrian and Cycle Counts (PCC), Manual Classified Counts (MCC) and Automatic Traffic Counts (ATC). These measured the number of pedestrians, cyclists and e-scooters; the number of cyclists, motorcyclists, cars, LGVs, OGVs (all of which have been classed as 'delivery' to produce clear and concise outputs) and buses; and the speeds of these vehicles (respectively). These surveys took place over three weekdays in May 2022 and June 2023 (Tuesday – Thursday) and over the weekend in May 2022 and June/July/September 2023 (Saturday and Sunday).

56. Site 1 – Broad Street West

User	IN			OUT		
	2022	2023	Difference	2022	2023	Difference
Pedestrians	13369	11139	-16.7%	13496	11813	-12.5%
Cyclists	1451	1675	15.5%	1932	1992	3.1%
E-Scooters	53	85	61.6%	37	71	93.5%
Motorcyclists	35	47	33.3%	49	56	14.2%
Cars	21	5	-75.8%	11	4	-59.5%
Delivery (LGV + OGV)	11	6	-45.4%	4	5	23.1%

Table 6 - showing the number of daily entries and exits to Broad Street west, average figures used.

57. Site 2 – Broad Street /Turl Street

User	IN (to Broad Street)			OUT (of Broad Street)		
	2022	2023	Difference	2022	2023	Difference
Pedestrians	5021	5804	15.6%	4602	5666	23.1%
Cyclists	1092	1210	10.8%	1056	1176	11.4%
E-Scooters	28	38	37.7%	16	33	100%
Motorcyclists	97	106	9.3%	78	100	28.5%
Cars	129	159	22.9%	122	132	8.6%
Delivery (LGV + OGV)	94	101	7.5%	89	82	-8.3%

Table 7 - showing the number of entries and exits to Broad Street from Turl Street, average figures used.

58. Site 3 – Broad Street East

User	IN			OUT		
	2022	2023	Difference	2022	2023	Difference
Pedestrians	8960	9649	7.7%	8059	9101	12.9%
Cyclists	2737	2726	-0.42%	2266	2236	-1.32%
E-Scooters	33	86	158.7%	38	114	196.4%
Motorcyclists	128	118	-7.8%	103	99	-4.6%
Cars	549	384	-30.1%	571	411	-28.1%
Delivery (LGV + OGV)	204	150	-26.3%	213	169	-20.7%

Table 8 - showing the number of entries and exits to Broad Street east, average figures used.

Pedestrians

59. Overall, the number of pedestrians entering and exiting Broad Street has increased. However, a 16.7% and 12.5% reduction in those entering and exiting respectively has been observed at the western end (Site 1). Whilst there was a 15.6% and 23.1% increase in those entering and exiting Turl Street respectively. This suggests that the pedestrian movements were rerouted via Turl Street. The observed reduction at the western end may be due to the temporary hoardings for a development site (The Store hotel) which creates the potential for conflict between all road users. This also correlates with consultation feedback that highlighted this issue. However, the general increase reflects the [City Council's announcement](#) that pedestrian levels of activity in the city centre are higher than pre-pandemic levels.

Cyclists

60. The number of cyclists entering and exiting Broad Street from the western end has increased, seeing a 15.5% and 3.1% increase respectively. Similarly, there has been a 10.8% and 11.4% increase in those entering and exiting Turl Street respectively. A slight decrease in cyclists is observed entering and exiting the eastern end by 0.42% and 1.32% respectively. The high number of cyclists using Broad Street correlates with the consultation feedback which saw 46.5% of respondents agree that this is an essential link through the city.

E-Scooters

61. The number of e-scooters has significantly increased (albeit from a small base) with a 61.6% and 93.5% increase of entries and exits at the western end; a 37.7% and 100% increase of entries and exits at the Turl Street junction, and a 158.7% and 196.4% increase of entries and exits at the eastern end of Broad Street. These can be attributed to an increase in the fleet, the installation of an e-scooter parking bay on the corner of Broad Street and Parks Road (specifically responsible for the significant increase at the eastern end) and the introduction 24-hour access to the scooters from October 2022 where previously they had been time-restricted.

Motorcycles

62. As per the ETRO proposal, existing motorcycle parking on Broad Street was relocated (and slightly reduced) to St Giles. Officers have observed that some motorcyclists have been displaced in nearby locations including Brasenose Lane and Mansfield Road. The County Council continue to engage with motorcycle representatives on motorcycle facilities across the city, including the new bay on St Giles, as well as food delivery partners. The traffic survey data indicated that 50-60 motorcycles travel through Broad Street on the average weekday, with an average of 47 entering and 56 exiting motorcycles being ridden west beyond the point where motor vehicles are not permitted. As mentioned in paragraph 49, the County Council are committed to installing additional enforcement measures at the western entrance to Broad Street, which will discourage motorcycle riders contravening the traffic regulations.

Private Cars

63. The traffic survey data suggests that overall, fewer cars are accessing Broad Street, however, those that are doing so are using Broad Street to access Turl Street. Private car usage has decreased at the western and eastern end of Broad Street; however, it has increased at the junction with Turl Street. A theory as to why there is an increase on Turl Street is that motorists who are unaware of the removal of parking are turning into Turl Street looking for parking. Another theory is that motorists are unaware they can loop round on Broad Street, instead they drive down Turl Street looking to exit the area. This can be related to the observations from site visits. During site visits, officers noted an increase in parking outside the Covered Market on Market Street, despite there only being loading bays here. PCN data suggests that this has been the case with 447 tickets issued on Market Street since October 2022. Furthermore, due to a variation in those entering and exiting Turl Street/Broad Street junction suggests some motorists are exiting onto Cornmarket Street via Ship/Market Street or may be those who are driving continuously around the street and have been picked up numerous times on the counters.

Delivery Vehicles

64. The traffic survey data shows an overall reduction in volumes of delivery and heavy goods vehicles. The western end has seen an average of 6 vehicles entering and exiting per day. The larger decrease in those entering (45.4% reduction) can be directly linked to the rising bollard that restricts through traffic at that location. The junction with Turl Street only saw minor changes, with a 7.5% increase in those entering and an 8.3% decrease in those exiting. The eastern end of Broad Street has seen a large decrease overall, with a number of delivery and heavy goods vehicles decreasing by 26.2% of those entering and a 20.7% reduction in those exiting.

Speeds

65. Average speeds on Broad Street have marginally increased on the weekday (Tuesday to Thursday) from 12.4mph to 13.0mph and have increased from

12.5mph to 12.6mph on the weekend. This figure includes all vehicles, including bicycles, cars, motorcycles and all classes of larger delivery vehicles, and buses. This could be attributed to the decreased presence of cars on the carriageway and a more open sense of space. Despite this increase in average speed, it is still well below the posted speed limit of 20mph.

Officer Site Visits and Observations

66. Throughout the duration of the scheme, over 50 visits have been made, 35 of which were specific monitoring exercises. During these visits, officers observed on multiple occasions vehicles parked illegally, either on double yellow lines; in the loading bays; in disabled bays; next to the disabled bays; or behind the disabled bay on the eastern side in the open carriageway. Officers also observed private cars continuing to use Broad Street as a drop off/pick up location within the city. It was also observed that private coaches on occasions would use Broad Street to pick up and drop off passengers. If the scheme is made permanent, it is recommended that additional interventions are investigated to address future ongoing issues, as set out in the recommendation in paragraph 1. Possible interventions could include a timed loading restriction and further restrictions to reduce general vehicles accessing the street. However, there is currently no funding identified to investigate further.

67. Observations of note on Broad Street include:

- The use of the seating by customers of local businesses, e.g., patrons from the pubs spending extended periods of time here, using the wider extent of the seating to meet with friends (especially in the evenings).
- Walking tour groups being able to safely meet here; a leader of one local tour groups expressed their gratitude towards the change during an officer visit.
- Various groups organising to meet here on summer evenings, e.g., a rookie chess tournament.

68. It was monitored and observed that the cycle parking was well used, notably more so during term time. It was noted that as a result of this, there are a number of 'wild cycles⁵' along Broad Street at any given day, often where there is not cycle parking nearby (despite there being additional cycle racks on Broad Street providing 172 spaces across the entire length, where there had previously been 58).

Road Safety

Road Safety Audits

69. Stages 1-3 of the Road Safety Audit (RSA) process have been completed to date. A Stage 4 RSA will follow once 12 months of validated road traffic collision data has been received.

70. Some recommendations from the Stage 3 RSA are yet to be undertaken due to their permanent nature. These recommendations specifically include the

⁵ A bicycle that is parked in an area that is not designated cycle parking, e.g., chained to a lamppost.

introductions of permanent tactile paving and dropped kerbs in the areas where there is currently temporary tactile paving and temporary kerb ramps. Officers recommend that should the Broad Street ETRO be made permanent, then these RSA recommendations should be implemented using the remaining budget.

Collision Data

71. A total of 14 collisions have taken place since 2017 according to the council's road collision database, with the most recently reported in late 2021. Of these collisions, 12 were categorised as "minor" incidents and the remaining two were "serious" incidents. Those serious incidents that took place were car-parking related. A collision reported by a member of the public to the project team took place at the bike racks outside Balliol College, however at the time of writing it has not been reported to the Police and therefore is excluded from the above figure.

Provision of Loading and Disabled Parking

Disabled Bays

72. Before the scheme was implemented, there were eight disabled bays on Broad Street. Under the current scheme, the number of disabled bays on Broad Street has reduced to four. However, five disabled bays were installed on Parks Road as part of this scheme. Therefore, the number of disabled bays within this area of the city has increased by one.

73. It has been observed that these disabled bays are well used by blue badge holders. However, officers observed on occasion that private cars and delivery vehicles use these bays. Since the scheme began, 64 penalty charge notices have been issued to vehicles parked in disabled bays without a blue badge. These users have also been observed double parking within the disabled bay, or next to them. This adds a constraint to the blue badge holders when trying to access their vehicle, especially when using a mobility aid.

74. Stakeholders have highlighted that the spaces on Parks Road do not allow for easy access to and from vehicles due to the camber of road. It was also noted that there is now an additional distance that people are required to travel to access the city centre from Parks Road, which is approximately 200m further away from the previous location of the bays on Broad Street.

Loading Bays

75. Pre-scheme there were five loading bays on Broad Street which were all restricted to 6am – 6.30pm. The scheme introduced a 24/7 restricted loading area; a reduction in the number of bays to three and a change of layout in loading provisions. This change in layout meant that the sizes of the public realm spaces were optimised, whilst still providing adequate loading facilities.

76. The average number of delivery vehicles (LGVs and OGVs) using Broad Street on a weekday has fallen by 23.5% in total; in 2022 there were approximately 400

delivery movements per weekday (both in and out of Broad Street), and in 2023 there were approximately 300, which represents 5.6% of all movements.

77. On occasion it has been observed that delivery vehicles are unable to use the marked loading bays due to illegally parked vehicles and then forced to load/unload on double yellow lines, which is permitted.

Air Quality

78. Air quality surveys were commissioned by the County Council prior to the scheme beginning. Monthly readings have been recorded since March 2022, when two diffusion tubes were installed on Broad Street.

79. Pre scheme measurements identified air quality levels were at $14\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$, which is below the national legal limit for NO_2 ($40\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$) and the local annual mean target ($30\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$).

80. Air quality data for 2023 is not yet available due to the need to have a full year of readings, therefore a like-for-like comparison cannot be made with the 2022 data. However, due to the reduction of motorised vehicles using Broad Street air quality is expected to remain under the national and local limits, with the potential to have also seen a further reduction in NO_2 levels.

Events

81. The current layout of Broad Street offers event organisers two separate spaces to operate an event, allowing either one or both spaces to be used depending on the requirements of the event. The positioning of planters offers a robust level of Hostile Vehicle Mitigation, which prior to the scheme being introduced would need to be provided by the event organiser, usually in the form of a large vehicle. The layout also enables an event to run whilst maintaining an east/west cycle route through the street and maintains all other functions of the street (loading, disabled parking, two bus services).

82. The 2021/22 financial year (FY) saw 31 events over 40 days and 21 hours, 17 of which were during the Broad Meadow scheme. In the 2022/23 FY, there were 17 events over 41 days. In 2023/24 FY, to date there have been 12 events spanning over 23 days, with the Oxford City Christmas Market running for 24 days in December 2023 this brings the total so far to 13 events over 47 days. While the number of events has decreased on Broad Street, the duration of events has increased. Since the scheme began in October 2022, there have been a total of 20 events (including the upcoming event in December 2023).

83. Four of the events organised in 2023/24 were new to Broad Street, showing that the reduction in traffic, removal of parking and opening up of the space has succeeded in attracting and encouraging new events to take place. The space has also been used for protests and vigils. Returning events have taken place, such as Town & Gown, the Oxford Half Marathon and the Jewish Culture Fair. This year, the Oxford City Christmas Market runs for a longer period of 24 days, demonstrating that the street can continue to hold a Christmas market whilst

maintaining cycle access, however the County Council are open to exploring a new location that may offer a greater footprint for event organisers to hold larger scale events.

84. Bearing in mind the status of Broad Street as highway maintainable at the public expense, officers have engaged with event organisers throughout the development of the Broad Street scheme, including since opening. Working with Oxford City Council's Events team and the County Council's Events team, officers have adapted the layout of seating and planters to minimise the amount of movement required to set up/set down an event. In some cases, the current layout enables small scale events to operate without any movement to planters required.
85. Officers have provided input into the terms and conditions relating to the Broad Street scheme in the [Broad Street Protocol](#).

Local Businesses

86. Officers have engaged with local businesses on Broad Street throughout the development of the scheme, including since opening. Engagement has mostly taken place face-to-face and on the phone. Officers have also attended the recently formed Broad Street Traders Association meetings which offer a forum for businesses to share their views with both councils.
87. Since opening, adjustments have been made to the layout of seating and planters following feedback received from individual businesses relating to noise at night and specific locations of seating. Overall, the scheme itself has been well received by businesses on Broad Street, including walking tour guides who now have a dedicated safe place to gather. The council have also received interest from local businesses to introduce additional street trader pitches in both spaces, which is currently being explored with the City Council, who are the licensing authority.
88. Further feedback from businesses has been received specifically in relation to events held on Broad Street. Many businesses have reported disruptions to trade when larger scale events are operating, citing the layout of stalls as having the biggest impact. Further comments have been received relating to the logistics of event set up/set down and resetting the furniture to its previous positions.
89. Officers from both councils continue to work with businesses and event organisers to address where possible any concerns raised at previous events. It should be noted that the responsibilities of events within the two public spaces is managed by Oxford City Council.

Officer Recommendation

90. On balance, the temporary Broad Street scheme has been a positive addition to the street. The experimental nature has offered the opportunity to test different seating arrangements, introduce adaptations and test different event set ups. Considering the concerns raised and areas identified for improvement, officers recommend the following:

- Make the current Experimental Traffic Regulation Order (ETRO) on Broad Street permanent to a Traffic Regulation Order, retaining the current street furniture until a more permanent scheme is developed and further funding is secured.
- Subject to remaining budget for the temporary scheme, implement the recommended interventions set out in paragraph 70.
- To seek funding to investigate medium- and longer-term measures as part of a newly funded project that will further enhance Broad Street and surrounding streets, taking into consideration any additional interventions noted within this report.

Bill Cotton
Corporate Director, Environment and Place

Annexes

Annex 1 – Equalities Impact Assessment
Annex 2 – Climate Impact Assessment
Annex 3 – Survey Responses Report

Contact Officers:

Lucy Prismall – Principal Planner (Mobility and Place)